# Some Hil·lûfîm Ben Asher/Ben Naftali in the Manuscript M1

M.ª Teresa ORTEGA MONASTERIO CSIC, Madrid

# 1. Introduction

The manuscript M1 (Madrid, Complutensian University Library) is being studied by the Hebrew Bible Team at the Instituto de Filología of the CSIC. We are preparing now the edition of the masorah of the Pentateuch. This manuscript has been considered one of the codices which served as basis for the Hebrew text of the *Complutensian Polyglot* edited by Ximenez de Cisneros between 1514 and 1517.

Besides the Masorah Magna written in the upper and lower margins of the text, some long masoretic appendices, which were too long for the margins, are given at the end of several divisions of the Bible. They are written in three columns of 32 lines each. The first one is an appendix to the Pentatench and occupies fols. 81a, third column, to 83a, and contains the following masoretic lists:

- 1) A register giving the total sum of the parasiyyôt, verses, the middle verse, the words, middle word, letters and middle letter of each book of the Pentateuch. In the last page of Genesis, the number of times which patah occurs with the pausal accent 'atnah and sôf pasûq also appears.
- 2) The number of hil·lûfîm BA/BN in each book of the Pentateuch.
- 3) A complete list of the summaries to each of the parasiyyôt giving the sĕdarîm, pĕsaqîm, words, letters, hil·lûfîm, and others.

Other appendices are: a list of variations between madin-ha'e/ma'arba'e in the book of Kings, given at the end of the Former Prophets (which is no more in the manuscript); the variations in the number of letters in several of the parasiyyôt at the end of the Latter Prophets, and a final list at the end of Chronicles containing more than eighty lists, including extraordinary points, lists of qere/ketîb, plene and defective spellings, and others.

The manuscript M1 was studied by my colleague Dr. Fernández Tejero years ago, but the masorah and these appendices have never been published. In this paper, I will analyze part of the lists, those notices concerning the hil lûfîm Ben Asher / Ben Naphtali in the books of Genesis and Exodus. In the future, I plan to analyze these lists in the rest of the Pentateuch. In these two books, I have recorded as many as 110 cases 1.

At the end of *Deuteronomy*, in page 81a of the manuscript, in the third column, it reads:

פלגתות שבין בן אשר ובן נפתלי ספר בראשית חמשים ושלוש פלוגתות ספר ואלה שמות ארבעים פלוגתות ספר ויקרא עשרים ושנים פלוגתות ספר ויקרא עשרים ושנים פלוגתות הידמר [sic] חמשים ושלושת משנה תורה ארבעים ושלוש פלוגתות ...

The next page (81b) starts with commentaries about the parasah בראשית, and gives different notices divided in parasiyyôt.

I have selected the cases of hil·lûfîm BA/BN of the appendix, and found 40 cases in Genesis and 22 in Exodus. On the one side, many of them are also recorded in the margins of the text of M1, but some others are specific of these lists. On the other side, some cases are recorded in the margins of the text giving the readings BA/BN, but are not recorded in the lists. In total, we have 70 cases in Genesis and 40 in Exodus. The note of the appendix says that there are 53 hil·lûfîm in Genesis and 40 in Exodus. In the second case, it agrees with my computing.

As I have just mentioned, all these cases can be classified in three groups:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For this study, I have used the lists of the Lipschütz, Mishael ben Uzziel's Treatise on the Differences Between Ben Asher and Ben Naphtali, Textus 2 (1962) pp. 3-8, and F. PÉREZ CASTRO and M. J. de AZCÁRRAGA, The Edition of the Kitab al-Khilaf of Misael Ben Uzziel, in In Memoriam Paul Kahle (Berlin 1968).

- 1) Words quoted in the appendix but not in the margins of the text of M1 (18 cases in *Genesis*, 9 in *Exodus*).
- 2) Words quoted in the margins of M1 but not in the appendix (30 cases in *Genesis*, 15 in *Exodus*).
- 3) Words quoted in both instances (22 cases in Genesis, 10 in Exodus).

I have compared every case identified in the lists with the text of M1 in the corresponding passage. The appendix does not give the specific reading of BA or BN, it simply quotes the word, and in some cases, with some vocalization or  $ga\ ya$ . The text itself only says that there is a  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{\imath}l$ , and in some cases, with some vocalization or  $ga\ ya$ . The text itself only says that there is a  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{\imath}l$  in the passage. For instance, in page 81b it reads: ... מחלופים אשר בתוך הגר [Gen 3,3] ובלא חלוף.

In this case, M1 indicates the accents, but this is not always like this. Examples of other cases where it vocalizes a consonant or writes the ga 'ya' are found in Gen 7,4 (אֶת־כל היקום), Gen 25,32 (כִּי עתה) or Gen 26,22 (כִי עתה), but in these cases the manuscript does not give both readings.

In order to know the exact differences between BA and BN, we have to find them in the cases where both readings are written in the margins of the text. There are 52 of these cases in the book of *Genesis* and 25 in Exodus. We have to take into account that there is a lacuna from Ex 9,33 to 24,7 in M1. Some of these cases are not recorded in the appendix (30 in Genesis and 15 in Exodus). In three of them, Ex 2,17, 3,8 and 9,31 in the appendix, it is specified that the passage has no  $h\hat{u}l\cdot l\hat{u}f$ , as follows:

```
2,17 נְיְגְרְשוֹם ... נִיְגְרְשוֹם ... נִיְגְרְשוֹם ... ... בלא חילוף לְהַצִּילוֹ ... לְהצילו ... ... הַשְּעֹרָה 13,8 ... הַשְעֹרָה ... הַשְּעֹרָה ...
```

The usual way to indicate that a passage has no  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{u}f$  is to introduce the words with the note ובלא חילוף, and add the passage with its vocalization. Sometimes, the scribe insists on the exact place where there is no difference. In Gen 24,11, it is written: לַעָּת בָּאַת הַשְּׁאֲבוֹת בַלֹא געיה (in the ה).

# 2. Internal concordance

From the comparison of the notes of the appendix with the text of the manuscript and the marginal readings BA/BN, I affirm that the internal concordance of the manuscript is very high. In *Genesis*, both texts differ in only five of the 20 cases studied with a note BA/BN and whose passages are also recorded in the appendix.

For instance, the word גר־ותוֹשֶׁב of the expression גר־ותוֹשֶׁב (Gen 23,4) appears without ga 'ya' in the appendix, and with ga 'ya' in the text. This last reading agrees with BN. A similar case occurs in Gen 27,13. The word קלְלְתְּדְ appears with ga 'ya' in the qôf in the appendix, and without ga 'ya' in the text, according this time with BA reading. The other cases are Gen 42,21 (וְּשְׁתְּחָנוֹץ), 43,26 (וְיִשְׁתְחַנוֹץ) and 49,8 (בְּהַתְחְנְנִנוֹ). In the first one, the MP says: ל ופלוגתא דבן אשר. In the other 15 cases, the text is identical with that of the appendix.

In some cases, the readings given in the margins of the text disagree with Ben Uzziel's. Out of the 40 cases of *Genesis* recorded in the appendix, there are six passages where M1 is contrary to Ben Uzziel, and gives a different  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{\imath}l$ : 30,16 (מָן), 32,9 (מַּמְחֵנֶה), 32,9 (הַמְחֵנֶה), 35,12 (וְלְּצֵרְעֵןּך), 36,16 (אַלּוּרְנָן) and 46,23 (וְלְצֵרְעֵןּר).

In the case of Exodus, 13 of the 25 cases registered in the appendix are also registered in the margins of the text. We must remember that there is a gap in the manuscript. Only in four of these 13 cases, the text of the appendix disagrees with M1: Ex 3,5 (שָּל), 7,13 (שַּבָּחָל), 24,11 (מַחַחַר), and 25,30 (שֵל) and the  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{\imath}l\hat{\jmath}$  always refers to the ga ya. In the other 9 cases, the text of M1 is identical to the text of the appendix. In one case, 6,27 (הַמְדְבְּרִים), the following is written in the margin by a different hand: חטוף בלי פלוגתא דבן אשר ובן נפתלי ובמסור אחרה. In all these cases, the  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{\imath}l$  BA/BN is identical in M1 and in Ben Uzziel.

Two mistakes of differences BA/BN are found in the margins of the text of Exodus. The first one is in 33,5. Concerning the word בן אשר אָל כל בן נפ אל־כל. In the verse 33,5, בן אשר אָל כל בן נפ אל־כל appear. It may have been confused with 35,4. This  $h\hat{\imath}l\cdot l\hat{\imath}df$  appears in Ben Hayyim's lists. The second one is in 38,30. Concerning בן אשר את כל

בן נפ אַת כל In 38,30, only ואת כל appears. It may have been confused with 38,3, where את כל כלי appears. This case is also quoted in Ben Hayyim and in the appendix.

# 3. M1 HIL·LÛFÎM AND OTHER SOURCES

After having verified the internal concordance of the manuscript, I will analyze its similarities with other sources. I have compared it with two very well known works which frequently refer to Spanish manuscripts. These are Menahem de Lonzano's 'Ôr Tôrah and Norzi's Minhat Šay. Both works very often quote notes about hil·lûfîm or readings BA/BN. They do not always give both readings exactly, but only one of them, and sometimes they deal with Spanish codices and how they should be written.

In the 'Or Tôrah, we cannot find much support. From all the cases of hil·lûfîm quoted in M1 in Genesis and Exodus, only seven give some notice, and they are placed in Genesis. In two cases, the opinion refers to words contained only in the appendix, and does not specify the exact difference between the two schools. For instance, in Gen 22,8, concerning the word אַרְאָאָ, Lonzano writes: «without ga ya'». In two cases, he refers to the Sifrê Sefarad: first, in Gen 39,6, concerning the word אָרָפּה he says: «פּרָה with maqqef, not with ma arîk in Sifrê Sefarad»; second, in Gen 38,9, referring to the words אול איל של לא לא with dages in Sifrê Sefarad». In the first case, the reading agrees with BA; in the second one it is a different notice, but it agrees with M1 text. In the other three cases (36,16, 45,14 and 33,10), Lonzano's readings agree with the text of M1 and in the latter also with BA. The other two are BN readings.

Minhat Šay gives more information about the cases we are dealing with. It refers to 23 cases in Genesis and 3 in Exodus. It is surprising that only a few cases concerning hil·lûfîm are quoted in Exodus in both works, 'Ôr Tôrah and Minhat Šay. In 19 cases of Genesis, Norzi gives the two readings as in the margins of M1. The other four cases are: Gen 24,55 (הַנְערה), where Norzi gives the BA reading with ga'ya' contrary to the note of M1; Gen 27,13 (קללתד), where Norzi gives the reading without ga'ya' as BA; Gen 30,42 (אַבְּהַעְטִירְ), where Norzi only gives the BA reading with two gea'yôt (in the 1 and in the v);

and Gen 45,14 (בּניְמִיץ), where Norzi gives the first  $\gamma$  with ga'ya' as BA, and the  $\alpha$  with ga'ya' as BN.

In Exodus, the first case quoted by Norzi (5,13) lacks in M1. The other two cases are 32,13, and 38,26, but the latter is erroneously given in Ex 38,1. In 32,13, he gives a reading different from that of M1: he notes אַת־יַּרְעַכָּם with ga ya'a as BA, contrary to the note in M1. He does not write anything about BN reading. In 38,26, he gives יַּחְמֵשׁ with merkah under the n as BA reading and with the accent under the n as BN. In this case, he agrees with the note of M1.

In short, in most of the cases mentioned by Lonzano and Norzi, their opinions agree with the notes given in the margins of M1, specially in the cases where they refer to Spanish codices.

I have also compared the hil·lûfîm of M1 with the list published by Ben Hayyim in his Rabbinic Bible. In Genesis, Ben Hayyim agrees with 16 cases where M1 has a BA/BN note in the appendix and in the margin of the text, and with 30 cases only quoted in the margin. The list of cases recorded in the margins is totally included in Ben Hayyim.

In 21 cases, Ben Hayyim's readings agree with BA/BN readings of M1. In one case, Gen 6,7 concerning the word אַשָּׁר, Ben Hayyim does not specify the difference. He vocalizes both readings identically. In eight cases, Ben Hayyim gives a reading different from that of M1; sometimes he inverts the readings. This means that BA reading in M1 is BN reading in Ben Hayyim. This is the case of תַּנְּעָרָה (Gen 24,55). In M1 the BA reading is without ga'ya' under the  $\pi$ , and in Ben Hayyim the BA reading is with ga'ya'. Sometimes Ben Hayyim differs in the hil-lia itself, as in Gen 32,18, concerning the word יְּבְּנָשְׁרְ בּוֹ נִפּ יִפְנֶשׁךְ בּוֹ נִפּ יִפְנֶשׁךְ, with ga'ya', and Ben Hayyim reads בן אש יִפּגשׁך בן נפ יִפּגְשׁך, and marks the difference in the dages or the rafeh.

In the other 16 cases, Ben Hayyim agrees with the hil·lûfîm of M1. In three cases, it gives a different reading and in two, its readings agree with Ben Uzziel's and are contrary to M1. For instance, in Gen 32,27, concerning the word אָשְׁלַחָּדְ, in M1 the BA reading is v, without ga'ya', and in Ben Uzziel and in Ben Hayyim, the reading is with ga'ya'. In general, in 32 of the

46 passages, M1 agrees with Ben Hayyim. In only two cases, M1 gives a different reading from Ben Hayyim and Ben Uzziel, and they refer to the same word: תַּמְחָנָה. M1 gives הַ as BA reading and ה without ga'ya' as BN reading. Ben Uzziel gives the  $hil \cdot l\hat{u}f$  inverted (BA without ga'ya' and BN with it). Ben Hayyim points the BA reading with the ga'ya' under the  $\lambda$ , and the BN reading with  $m\hat{u}nah$  and without ga'ya' in the  $\lambda$ .

In Ben Hayyim's Bible, as well as in the mentioned cases of Lonzano and Norzi, the number of cases quoted in the book of *Exodus* are also few in comparison with those of *Genesis*. 16 of the 40 cases with a note in M1 are quoted in Ben Hayyim's list. In three passages, Ben Hayyim gives the  $hil \cdot l\hat{u}f$  inverted. In Gen 32,13, he gives a different reading. Concerning the words אָת-זַּרְעָכֶּם, he gives a with merkah as a BA reading and with maqqef as a BN reading.

# 4. BA/BN READINGS

Only in 15 of all the studied cases, M1 has a different reading from BA and BN. In the rest of the cases, 40 are BA readings and 32 are BN readings. In 12 occasions, the text of the manuscript has been corrected to convert it into BN in six cases and into BA in four. In one case, Gen 35,12 (אַלְּבְּרֶבְּרָ), the manuscript corrects the text to convert it into BA as specified in the M1 margin, but this is contrary to Ben Uzziel. In one case (Ex 39,1 וְּמִרְכֵּלֶת), it corrects the text to make it BA as in Ben Uzziel's list. In conclusion, the manuscript has never a special reading without support. Only in one case (Gen 35,12), the correction is to make it coherent with its own note.

As Dr. Fernández Tejero says in the study of the manuscript, this is a mixed text with special characteristics as all manuscripts. In some passages, the text has been corrected to adapt the reading sometimes to BA and sometimes to BN. M1 does not follow a certain school. It is important to remark that it has always support from other good manuscripts and sources, such as Norzi, Lonzano, and even Ben Hayyim. Norzi agrees with the M1 readings in 17 cases of Genesis and in three of Exodus. In some of them, he specifies that this is the correct reading of the Sifrê Sefarad.

# 5. The appendix text

As we can see in the tables, the text of the  $hil \cdot l\hat{u}f\hat{m}$  in the appendix is not fully vocalized. Sometimes it is not vocalized at all, and sometimes it only gives some punctuation without specifying if it corresponds to a BA or a BN text. In many cases, it does not agree with the text of the manuscript. In the cases where the passage is also quoted in the margin of the text, the appendix text sometimes does not agree either with the text of the margin or with the text itself. Besides, the notes about the readings BA/BN of the margins of the text are written by a hand different from that of the masorah of the manuscript, although the handwriting is very similar. In some cases, the handwriting is even very different, as in the explanation given in Ex 6,27.

In my opinion, it is clear that each list corresponds to a different scribe and to a different source, even if they coincide in many cases. The main value of the appendix is that it gives more information, and sometimes, this information about the text differs from that of other manuscripts.

In the next pages, I offer the lists of passages studied. The abbreviations are as follows: TM1 = text of ms. M1; MM1 = Masorah Magna in ms. M1; AM1 = Appendix in ms. M1.

ENESIS

| Verse | TM1                   | MM1                               | AM1                          | Ben Uzziel Lonzano | Lonzano | Norzi             | Ben Hayyim |
|-------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|---------|-------------------|------------|
| 1,24  | נחֵיתו־ארץ            | החיתו ארץ BA<br>החיתו-ארץ BN      |                              |                    |         |                   | ll.        |
| 2,6   | והשקה אֲת־כל          | והשקה אֶת כל BA<br>והשקה את־כל BN |                              |                    |         | אָת BA<br>אֶת- BN | II         |
| 2,16  | מִכֵּל עֵץ־הַגַּן     | מכל עץ־הגן BA<br>מכל עץ BN        |                              |                    |         |                   | #          |
| 3,3   | אשר בתָּוּך־הֹגוְ     |                                   | אשר בתוך הגן<br>אשר בתוך הגן |                    |         |                   |            |
| 3,17  | (ב m d) תאבׁלנה)      | תא <u>כ</u> לנה BA<br>תאכלנה BN   |                              | ==                 |         | BA 2<br>g Na      | 11         |
| 6,7   | אַשר־בראתי            | אשר בראתי BA<br>אשר בראתי BN      |                              | :                  |         |                   | #          |
| 6,9   | קַתּחלך־נח            | התחלך נח BA<br>התחלך-נח BN        |                              |                    |         |                   | II .       |
| 7,4   | (אֵ m d) אֶת־כל היקום |                                   | את כל היקום<br>אֶת־כל היקום  |                    |         |                   |            |
| 7,23  | רימח אֲת־             | וימח אַת BA<br>את-כל BN           |                              |                    |         |                   | #          |
| 9,2   | וְבְּכִל־דְגֵי        | BA ,τες-τες BB ,τες-τες BN        |                              |                    |         | BA }<br>BN }      | II.        |

GENESIS

| Verse | TM1   | MM1                            | AM1                            | Ben Uzziel | Lonzano        | Norzi          | Ben Hayyim |
|-------|---|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------|----------------|----------------|------------|
| 9,10  | וּבְבָל חית הארץ  |                                | ובכל חית הארץ<br>ובכל חית הארץ |            |                |                |            |
| 11,2  | נימצאו'   | וימצאו־בקעה BA<br>וימצאו<br>BN |                                |            |                | BA ;<br>BN ;   | II         |
| 13,12 | (נְ m d) נֵיָּאֲמַל (13,12)   | ן יאהל BA<br>ייאהל BN          |                                |            |                |                | II         |
| 13,15 | אָת-כל הארץ 13,15   |                                | אָת-כל הארץ                    |            |                |                |            |
| 18,26 | לְבֶל-המקום   |                                | לבְל המקום                     |            |                |                |            |
| 19,17 | (כֿ m q) פְּהוציאם (19,17   | EA בהוציאם<br>Enציאם BN        |                                | 11 11      |                | BA 5<br>BN 3   | II         |
| 21,9  | $^{21,9}$ את בֶּן הגר $^{6}$ (בֶּן m d) אֱת-בָּן-הגר $^{6}$ את ברחגר $^{6}$ | את בֶן הגר BA<br>את־בן־חגר BN  |                                |            |                |                | #          |
| 21,30 | אָת-הַבְּאֵר הזאת   |                                | אֶת הבאר הזאת                  |            |                |                |            |
| 22,8  | יראָה−לוּ השָׁה   |                                | יראה−לו השֶׁה                  |            | without ga'ya' |                |            |
| 22,12 | אָת־יחידדָ  |                                | אָת-יחידוּ                     |            |                |                |            |
| 23,4  | גֵר-ותוש <b>ב</b>   | גר־ותושב BA<br>גר ותושב BN     | גֵר-ותושב                      | 11 11      |                | גר BA<br>גר BN | II         |
| 23,11 | לא־אַדני 23,11  | אדני BA<br>לא־אדני<br>לא־ An   |                                |            |                |                | II         |

ENESIS

| Verse | TM1                        | MM1                           | AM1            | Ben Uzziel     | Lonzano | Norzi                 | Ben Hayyim |
|-------|----------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------|----------------|---------|-----------------------|------------|
| 24,30 | נאת-הצמדים 24,30           | את-הצמדים BA<br>את קאת BN     |                |                |         | BA ;<br>BN ;          | 11         |
| 24,55 | (ק הנערה) הַנעך 24,55      | הנערָה BA<br>הנערה BN         |                |                |         | ה BA<br>ה BN          | #          |
| 25,22 | נְיָתְרוצּץ                |                               | נ'נערנצא       |                |         |                       |            |
| 25,32 | (ל, m d) ולמה זה לי (25,32 |                               | ולמה זה לי     |                |         |                       |            |
| 26,22 | קי עתה 26,22               | כי עתה BA<br>כי עתה BN        | כי עתה         | ςι BA<br>ςι Nα |         | c، BA<br>c، BN        | H          |
| 26,27 | <u>ָר</u> ּתְשלחוני        |                               | נתשלחוני,      |                |         |                       |            |
| 27,13 | ۵ٍלدת۲                     | אללתך BA<br>קללתך BN          | <b>写くて</b> 化上  | 11 11          |         | קללתך BA<br>קללתף BN  |            |
| 27,27 | ניטרכהו 72,72.             |                               | ָנִיבּרכהו     |                |         |                       |            |
| 27,28 | נְיֵתֶּן־לְן 27,28         | ווטו לד BA<br>ויתן לד BN      |                |                |         | BA - ויְתן<br>ויתן BN | II         |
| 27,29 | ןיִשְׁמּחֵוּ לד 27,29      | ן ישתחו לד BA<br>ןישתחו לד BN |                |                |         | השתחו BA<br>השתחו BN  | 11         |
| 27,36 | ניאְקְבֵּנִי               | ויעקבני BA<br>ויעקבני BN      |                |                |         |                       | 11         |
| 27,40 | ועֵל-חובך 27,40            | ועל חרבך BA<br>ועל חרבך BN    | ואַל-חרבך תהיה | 11 11          |         |                       | 11         |

SISHZE

| Verse | TM1                   | MM1                        | AM1                   | Ben Uzziel              | Lonzano | Norzi                 | Ben Hayyim           |
|-------|-----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|---------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| 28,4  | וְיֵמֶּן־לִד          | וייתן לד BA<br>ייתן לד BN  |                       |                         |         |                       | #                    |
| 30,16 | ויבא יעקב מָן־השדה    | מֶן־השדה BA<br>מן־השדה BN  | ויבא יעקב<br>מֶן־השדה | dl- NA<br>BN ا          |         |                       |                      |
| 30,18 | ‹ھُھڌر                | κώψος<br>κώψες<br>ΒΝ       |                       | אשׁבָר BA<br>ישׁשְכר BN |         | BA ww<br>BN           | Ħ                    |
| 30,32 | שֶּׁת-חוּם            | שה-חום BA<br>שה חום BN     |                       |                         |         | שה- BA<br>BN          | =                    |
| 30,42 | ןּבְּהַצְּטיף הצשן    | ובהעטיף BA<br>ןבהעטיף BN   | וְבְּהַאֵמיף הצאו     | 11 11                   |         | BA בהעטיף<br>BN ביי   |                      |
| 31,39 | וגגבתי                |                            | الإزجابة              |                         | Ļ       |                       |                      |
| 32,9  | אל-הַמחנה             | אל המחנה BA<br>אל-המחנה BN | אל הַמחנה האחת        | BA n<br>ji<br>BN ji     |         |                       | ממחנה BA<br>המחנה BN |
| 32,9  | <u>הַ</u> מּחנה       | קמחנה BA<br>המחנה BN       | והיה הַמחנה           | ה BA<br>ה BN            |         |                       | המחנה BA<br>המחנה BN |
| 32,18 | (پر m d) در نوډښه     | οι ισέψη ΒΑ<br>Οι ισέψη ΒΝ |                       |                         |         | BA Τυξο'<br>BN        | #                    |
| 32,27 | לא אשַלחך 72,27       | BA אשלחד<br>BN אשלחך       | לא אשָלחדָ            | שְל BA<br>שֵל BN        |         | ВА <sup>ф</sup><br>ВN | =                    |
| 32,31 | שם המקום <u>12,31</u> |                            | <b>א</b> ֶם המקום     |                         |         | ****                  |                      |

| Verse | TM1                             | MM1                             | AMı                 | Ben Uzziel                                     | Lonzano                         | Norzi              | Ben Hayyim |
|-------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------|--|---------------------------------|--------------------|------------|
| 33,10 | (بر m d) جر برح-در 33,10        | כי על כן BA<br>כי־על כן BN      |                     |  | כי על                           | BA '2<br>BN        | #          |
| 34,3  | ַנֹּאֲׁשִׁם                     | אחב BA<br>ניאהב BN<br>ניאהב     | ַניָּאֶהב את הנערה  |  |                                 | אהב BA<br>ויאהב BN | ΙΙ         |
| 35,12 | (ן m d) ולזרעף 35,12            | ולזרעך BA<br>ןלזרעך BN          | לכזרעד              | BA j<br>BN j                                   |                                 |                    |            |
| 36,10 | ( בֶּ m d) בֶּן־בְּשָׁמֵת 16,98 |                                 | €\_&ัลฺตน           |  |                                 |                    |            |
| 36,16 | ฺ ฺื่ชั่เЬ_ฝ∟บ                  | אלוף קרח BA<br>אלוף קרח BN      | ี่ ชี่द่เ♭_ฝะบ      | BA 17<br>51 BN 2                               | some mss.<br>with <i>maqqef</i> |                    | - 11       |
| 37,10 | לקשתחבות 37,10                  | להשתחבות BA<br>להשתחבות BN      | לקשתחבות            | 11 11  |                                 |                    |            |
| 37,18 | ייְתנכלו 37,18                  | אתוכלו BA<br>היתוכלו BN         |                     |  |                                 |                    | #          |
| 38,9  | לא לו                           | א לא לו BA<br>לא לו BN<br>לא לו |                     |  | א in Sifrê<br>Sefarad           |                    | Ti .       |
| 39,6  | ְיְפֵּח־תאר                     | אפה- BA<br>יפה אפר<br>BN        | ויהי יוסף יְפָה־תאר | BN יפה- אוי פרר (פה- Sifré)<br>אפר-תאר Sefarad |                                 | יפה- BA<br>BN      | #          |
| 39,23 | 39,23 אֱת−כל 39,23              | את-כל BA<br>את כל BN            |                     |  |                                 | את- BA<br>BN       | 11         |
| 41,45 | 41,45 qu-nap                    | שם יוסף BA<br>שם יוסף BN        | ויקרא פרעה שֵם־יוסף |  |                                 |                    | 11         |

ENESIS

| ano Norzi Ben Hayyim | BA ? = =              | 11                            | #                        | II                                  |                   | 11                              | 11                       | and BA τις αντ ΒΝ είναι   Είναι ΒΝ είναι   Εί |                    | II                                     |
|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------|---|--------------------|--|
| Ben Uzziel Lonzano   | <b>i</b> f <b>i</b> l |                               | בחתחננו BA<br>בחתחננו BN |                                     |                   | היש-לכם BA<br>היש לכם BN        |                          | and בנגמין <i>mil·le`el</i>   | 11 11              | ובני דו BA                             |
| AM1                  | וליוסף גָבָּד         |                               | בקתְּחֵננו אלינו         |                                     | וישֿתַחוו לו ארצה | היַש-לכם                        |                          | על צוערי בניֵמן־אחיו  | ימלנו              | ובני-1ו                                |
| MM1                  | BA τὸ;<br>βΝ τὰ       | את כל אשר BA<br>אָת כל אשר BN | בהתחננו BA<br>בהתחננו BN | BA כמרגלים<br>במרגלים<br>BN במרגלים |                   | היש לכם BA<br>היש לכם<br>BN ביש | אל עבדך BA<br>אל עבדך BN | בנימין אחיו BA<br>בנימין אחיו BN  | ימנה BA<br>ימנה BN | ובני דו BA                             |
| TM1                  | 1 ç¢T                 | 41,56 พษา                     | בהתקננו 42,21            | קמרגלים 92,34<br>קמרגלים 42,30      | เงคริบเเ          | היִש-לכם <mark>44,19</mark>     | 44,24 TT \$4,24          | בנימין־אחיו 45,14   | ימנה               | ובני דו BA (ובני־דו m a) ובני דו 46.23 |
| Verse                | 41,50 م<br>بې ۱       | 41,56                         | 42,21                    | 42,30                               | 43,26             | 44,19                           | 44,24                    | 45,14   | מגה 46,17          | 46.23                                  |

ל ופלוגתא דבן אשר MP 1

| Verse | IMI                           | MM1                          | AMI               | Ben Uzziel                 | Ben Uzziel Lonzano Norzi Ben Hayyım | Norzı | Веп Наууіш |
|-------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------|------------|
| 46,27 | יוסף אשֶר-ילד 46,27 יוסף אשֶר |                              | ובני יוסף אשר ילד |                            |                                     |       |            |
| 46,27 | לבַית־יעקב 46,27              | לבית יעקב BA<br>לקית יעקב BN |                   |                            |                                     |       | 11         |
| 48,19 | יהיֶה-לְעם 48,19              | אהיה לעם BA<br>יהיה לעם BN   | יָהיֶה־לְעם       | אהיה לעם BA<br>יהיה לעם BN |                                     |       | II         |
| 49,8  | יְשְׁתַּחֲוו לך 8,94          |                              | יְשִתְחוּוּ לַדְ  |                            |                                     |       |            |

| - [  |                     |  |                              |                 |         |       |                    |
|------|---------------------|--|------------------------------|-----------------|---------|-------|--------------------|
| يو   | TM1                 | MM1  | AM1                          | Ben Uzziel      | Lonzano | Norzi | Norzi Ben Hayyim   |
| 7    | נֵיְגֶרשּום         | ריגרשום BA<br>ןיגרשום BN   | חלוף <u>ו</u> יגרשום<br>ובלא |                 |         |       | <i>‡</i>           |
|      | ፟ፙሩ_የለሩL            |  | שַּל־נעלך                    | של BA<br>שֵל BN |         |       |                    |
|      | לְהצילו             | ζηνίς<br>ζηνίςι<br>Καρικίςι  | ובלא חלוף לְהצילו            |                 |         |       |                    |
| ا ما | כי לא־יתן           | לא יתן BA כי לא-יתן<br>לא יתן BN   |                              |                 |         |       |                    |
| 7    | <u>הַמְד</u> ַבריִם | הְמְדַברים חטוף בלי פלוגתא דבן אשר ובן הַמְדַברים<br>נפתלי ובמסור אחרה המדבר |                              | e PA<br>آن NB   | 2       |       | BA<br>G<br>E<br>BN |

SUCOX

| Verse | TM1                | MM1                                 | AM1                  | Ben Uzziel                 | Lonzano | Norzi      | Ben Hayyim                       |
|-------|--------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|---------|------------|----------------------------------|
| 7,13  | ່ ໄດ້ມື່າ ປ        |                                     | زئشط                 | BA <u>1</u><br>BN <u>1</u> |         |            |                                  |
| 7,13  | <u>เ</u> จ๊น็เป    |                                     | <u> נְּמָ</u> מָאַ   | BA j<br>BN j               |         |            |                                  |
| 7,22  | נֿפֿטֿזל           |                                     | נגֿשֿאַ              | BA j<br>BN j               |         |            |                                  |
| 7,28  | ἀαςτΙ              | ανςτη ΒΑ<br>ανςτη ΒΝ                | מֹשכבן               | BA p<br>g NB               |         |            |                                  |
| 8,12  | หู่น−ตо⊤           | את מטך BA<br>אָת מטך BN             |                      |                            |         |            |                                  |
| 8,17  | אָם-אינן           | אם אינך BA<br>אם אינך BN<br>אם אינך | ָכִיאָם־אינך         | BA ox<br>BN ox             |         |            |                                  |
| 9,31  | <u>הְשְׁעִר</u> ִה | השערה BA<br>השערה BN                | ובלא חלוף כִּי השערה |                            |         |            |                                  |
| 9,33  | נַיּחָדלו          |                                     | ויחדלו               | BA j.<br>BN j              |         |            |                                  |
| 15,13 | lacks              | lacks                               | עם זה גאלת           | BA }<br>BN \$              |         | BA 3<br>BN |                                  |
| 16,12 | lacks              | lacks                               | שמעתי את תלנות       | אָת- BA<br>אֶת- BN         |         |            |                                  |
| 19,13 | lacks              | lacks                               | או ירה לַנַרָּה      |                            |         |            | או ירח יירה BA<br>או־ירח יירה BN |

**EXODUS** 

| Verse | TM1                     | MM1                         | AM1            | Ben Uzziel              | Lonzano | Norzi | Ben Hayyim |
|-------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------|-------------------------|---------|-------|------------|
| 23,12 | lacks                   | lacks                       | רינפש בן אמ'   | چا- BA<br>چا- BN<br>چا- |         |       |            |
| 24,11 | ั่นี้ตัวเ               | BA זיחזו<br>SN קיחזו        | ັເຕີນເ         | BA 1<br>BN 1            |         |       |            |
| 25,30 | עַל-השלחן               | עַל־השלחן BA<br>על־השלחן BN | עַל-השלחן      |                         |         |       |            |
| 26,22 | ולירכתי המשכן           |                             | ולירכתי המשכן  |                         |         |       |            |
| 28,1  | לכתני-לי                | לכהני לי BA<br>לכהני לי BN  |                |                         |         |       |            |
| 28,5  | ןאֱת־התכלת              |                             | נאֱת⁻התכלת     | lgA - אמר<br>מאתר BN    |         |       |            |
| 28,10 | ָנְאֶת-שמות<br>(נֶ m d) | ואת שמות BA<br>ואת שמות BN  |                |                         |         |       | Ш          |
| 28,33 | וּפַּאָמִינֵי זחב       |                             | ן פַּעַמני זהב | BA i<br>BN j            |         |       |            |
| 28,41 | וכהנו לי                | וכהנו־לי BA<br>וכהנו לי BN  |                |                         |         |       |            |
| 28,43 | או בגשתם אל             | בגשתם אל BA<br>או־בגשתם BN  |                |                         |         |       |            |

**EXODUS** 

| Ben Hayyim |                | 11                    | BA ηκ<br>βη- BN            | 11                       | #                                |                  | II                         | 11                          | #                          | אָת־בָּל BA<br>אֶת כֿל BN |  |
|------------|----------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--|
| Norzi      |                |                       | אָת- BA<br>BN              |                          |                                  |                  |                            |                             |                            |                           |  |
| Lonzano    |                |                       |                            |                          |                                  |                  |                            |                             |                            |                           |  |
| Ben Uzziel | BA<br>γι<br>βΝ | וקנמן BA<br>וקנמן BN  |                            |                          |                                  | BA -ηκ<br>BN -ηκ |                            | אֵל־ BA<br>אֵל־ BN          |                            |                           |  |
| AM1        | ובהעלת אהרן    | ולומו דשם             |                            |                          |                                  | אָת מעשה ייי     | אֱת-התכלת                  | אֶל־בצלאל                   |                            | ויעש אָת־כל־כלי<br>המזבח  |  |
| MM1        |                | וקנמון BA<br>וקנמו BN | את־זרעכם BA<br>את זרעכם BN | כי פרעה BA<br>כי־פרעה BN | אֵל כל BA<br>אֵל-כל BN<br>אֵל-כל |                  | את-התכלת BA<br>את התכלת BN | אל־בצלאל BA<br>אֱל בצלאל BN | על-השלחן BA<br>על השלחן BN |                           |  |
| TM1        | וּבְהעלת אהרן  | ולומֶן־בשם            | אֱת⁻זרעכם                  | פֿי פרעה                 | χ̂ς_                             | אָת־מעשה יהוה    | ชูน-คתכלת                  | אֶל-בצלאל                   | עַל-השלחן                  | ויעש אֱת־כל־כלי<br>המזבח  |  |
| Verse      | 30,8           | 30,23                 | 32,13                      | 32,25                    | 33,5²                            | 34,10            | 35,25                      | 36,2                        | 37,16                      | 38,3                      |  |

2 It is wrong. There is no אל כל on in this verse. It may have been confused with 35,4.

| MM1                          |
|------------------------------|
| וחמש מאות BA<br>וחמש מאות BN |
| את כל BA<br>את כל BN         |
| ומן־התכלת BA<br>ומן־התכלת BN |
| מטבעתיו BA<br>מטבעתיו BN     |
| את האבנט BA<br>וְאת האבנט BN |

<sup>3</sup> He gives the hil-lid in 38,1.
<sup>4</sup> It is a mistake. It is not 52 און את כל 14 is a mistake. It is not 52 און איז דו 14 ואר 14 is a mistake. It is not 52 און 14 ואר 14 is a mistake. It is not 52 און 14 ווי 14 הול 15 און 14 הול 15 און 15 או

### RESUMEN

El manuscrito M1 (Biblioteca de la Universidad Complutense de Madrid) está siendo estudiado actualmente por el equipo de Biblia Hebrea del Instituto de Filología del CSIC en Madrid. Intentamos realizar la edición de la masora del Pentateuco en los próximos tres años. Al final del Pentateuco el manuscrito presenta cuatro páginas, escritas a tres columnas de cuarenta y dos líneas cada una. Este apéndice contiene, entre otras cosas, un recuento del total de parasiyyôt, sedarîm, versículos, palabras y letras de cada libro del Pentateuco, así como el número exacto de diferencias entre Ben Ašer y Ben Naftalí de cada libro. En el presente artículo se estudia la concordancia interna de esas diferencias con el texto y masoras del propio manuscrito en los libros de Génesis y Éxodo, y para tener una visión más amplia de la cuestión, en una segunda fase se comparan las listas de hil·lûfîm con otros manuscritos tiberienses y con otras listas.

# **SUMMARY**

The manuscript M1 (Madrid, Complutensian University Library) is being studied by the Hebrew Bible Team in the Instituto de Filología at the CSIC. We will be preparing the edition of the masorah of the Pentateuch in the next three years. This manuscript presents at the end of the Pentateuch four pages, written in three columns of fourty two lines each. This appendix contains, among other lists, a register giving the total sum of all the parasiyyôt, sedarîm, verses, words and letters in each book of the Pentateuch, and the exact number of variations BA/BN in each book. In this paper, I have studied the internal concordance of the variations BA/BN with the manuscript in the books of Genesis and Exodus. As a second stage, I have compared the lists with the hil·lûfîm recordered in other tiberian manuscripts, and with other hil·lûfîm lists, in order to have a broader scope of the subject.